



A Report of: Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Annual Report 2018 – 2019

May 2019



City and County of Cardiff

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Ramesh Patel
(Chairperson)



Councillor Bob Derbyshire



Councillor Philippa Hill - John



Councillor Owen Jones



Councillor John Lancaster



Councillor Oliver Owen



Councillor Jacqueline Parry



Councillor Peter Wong



Councillor Ashley Wood

CHAIR'S FOREWORD

Once again 2018/19 has been a very busy year for Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee. In what seems like a very short space of time we have run twelve public meetings, scrutinised 30 important pieces of work and focused on a number of key topics as a part of our task & finish agenda, for example, litter & fly tipping and biodiversity.

As always, the Committee started the municipal year by developing its work programme that was supported by valuable contributions from external stakeholders (for example, Professor Stuart Cole, Royal Town Planning Institute, WRAP and Keep Wales Tidy), Cabinet Members and service areas.

With the work programme agreed, we set to work scrutinising a varied range of topics relevant to our terms of reference. In doing this we used our Committee letters to raise a number of important topics including:

- **Planning, Transport & Environment – Budget Briefing (2nd October 2018)** – the Committee expressed deep concerned at the financial position of the Directorate, commenting on the scale of the challenge in delivering £6.5 million of savings in 2019/20.
- **Air Quality – Progress Update (19th March 2019)** – the Committee supported a large section of the proposals, however, raised concerns that the Council was only aiming to achieving air quality compliance below the 40 µg/m³ target in a particular area, in the 'shortest time possible', when instead it should have been about doing everything it could to improve air quality across all of Cardiff in the 'shortest time possible'.
- **Recycling & Waste Management Strategy Update (6th November 2018)** – the Committee asked for confirmation on the VAT position of the Council's Commercial Waste Service for all transactions with businesses and the public. They felt that the ability to not levy VAT could provide the Council with a competitive advantage in this area. At the same time they suggested that the Council should lobby Welsh Government in an attempt to create a level playing field by introducing recycling targets on

commercial waste operators – not having to adhere to a recycling waste target is distinct advantage for private sector waste companies in Wales.

- **Highways Resurfacing Programme (2nd April 2019)** – the Committee asked that the Council should in future years, provide all Members with a complete list of the ‘Highways Resurfacing Programme’, and that a copy of the finalised document is made available for public scrutiny.

The most significant piece of work undertaken during the year was the task & finish exercise into ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’. This included five task group meetings that supported eleven separate witness sessions; dealt with 26 witnesses and made a series of theme based recommendations across the following areas - ‘Resource Allocation & Technology’, ‘Enforcement & Fines’, ‘Education & Awareness’, ‘Bins’, ‘Volunteering’, ‘Litter in General’, ‘Fast food Litter’, ‘Fly Tipping’, ‘Dog Fouling’, ‘Smoking Litter’ and ‘Chewing Gum’. All of this work was carried out with the hope that the findings would ultimately help make Cardiff a cleaner place. Key recommendations made during the inquiry included:

- The creation of a dedicated Litter Enforcement Team in addition to existing resources to be delivered on a cost neutral basis;
- Refreshing the ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign and using more social media to deliver targeted education and awareness messages;
- Improving the Council’s digital litter reporting processes, for example, expanding the number of litter offences that can be reported through the Council’s new app;
- Better bin management by improving the collection of data, along with the roll out of fewer but bigger bins;
- To make the Council’s Volunteer Co-ordinator Post permanent to help further grow Cardiff’s litter picking volunteer networks;
- Issuing fast food litter awareness stickers to all of Cardiff’s fast food retailers;
- End to end digitalisation of the Council’s fly tipping removal and reporting process.

During 2018/19 the Committee made a conscious effort to ensure that public engagement was at the heart of much of its work. In doing this it undertook a number of high profile public interest items such as the joint scrutiny into 'Public Spaces Protection Order: Proposed Dog Controls (11th November 2018)'. This gathered significant interest in our work and helped contribute towards our wider public engagement goal. By the end of the year the Committee managed to:

- Invite 55 witnesses to take part in Committee and task & finish meetings – 38 of these witnesses were external to the Council;
- Received 343 live webcast views and 1,468 Facebook supported webcast views of Committee meetings;
- As a part of the Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff' inquiry the Committee ran a public survey to test resident views on litter and fly tipping that was completed by 3,433 people. In addition to this the Committee ran a very well supported volunteer workshop to gain a better understanding of the challenges facing litter picking volunteers in Cardiff.

To conclude my foreword I would like to thank all of the Members of the Committee, the Cabinet, external witnesses and officers who have supported our work. In particular, it has been a pleasure to work with an excellent group of Councillors who have, without exception, actively engaged in their roles at every single meeting. I look forward to your continued support in the year to come.



Councillor Ramesh Patel

Chairperson - Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

INTRODUCTION

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of transport, sustainability, and waste.

This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2018/19. Between June 2018 and May 2019 the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Briefing Information** – Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject that has environmental implications to the Council and the City. During 2018/19 examples included:
 - Tree Management (**5th June 2018**);
 - Section 106 Local Infrastructure Proposals Lists - Member Briefing (**3rd July 2018**);
 - Public Space Protection Orders – Dog Controls - Member Briefing (**3rd July 2018**);
 - Member Briefing: Second Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (**4th September 2018**);
 - Parking Enforcement Update (**4th September 2018**);
 - Planning, Transport & Environment – Budget Briefing (**2nd October 2018**);
 - Cardiff Cycling Programme Update (**2nd October 2018**);
 - Member Briefing Note: Road Naming Policy (**6th November 2018**);
 - Improving Public Transport – Response to Welsh Government White Paper (Paving Report) (**19th March 2019**).
- **Inquiries** – Where the Committee had undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. During 2018/19 examples included:

- Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled Restore Our Rivers;
 - Managing Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff;
 - Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Inquiry Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality';
 - Managing the Natural Environment & Biodiversity in Cardiff.
- **Performance Monitoring** – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance. During 2018/19 examples included:
 - Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & 4 Performance Reports 2017/18 (3rd July 2018);
 - Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 1 & 2 Performance Reports 2018/19 (4th December 2018).
 - **Policy Review** - Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example, by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required. During 2018/19 examples included:
 - Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate Delivery Plan 2018/19 (3rd July 2018) and 2019/20 (7th May 2019);
 - Joint Meeting: Funding the New Bus Transport Interchange (18th July 2018);
 - Recycling & Waste Management Strategy Update (6th November 2018);
 - Joint Meeting: Public Spaces Protection Order: Proposed Dog Controls (11th November 2018);
 - Air Quality – Progress Update (19th March 2019);
 - Highways Resurfacing Programme (2nd April 2019);

- Lamby Way Solar Farm – Progress Update (2nd April 2019).
- **Pre Decision Scrutiny** – This provides the Committee with an opportunity to evaluate and comment on policy proposals before they go to the Council’s Cabinet. This gives the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members’ views prior to making their decision. During 2015/16 examples included:
 - Second Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (4th September 2018);
 - Clamping & Removal of Nuisance Vehicles from Highway & Public Land (6th November 2018);
 - Draft Budget Proposals 2019/20 – Corporate Overview (18th February 2019);
 - Draft Corporate Plan 2019 to 2022 & 2019/20 Draft Budget Proposals - Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio (18th February 2019);
 - Draft Corporate Plan 2019 to 2022 & 2019/20 Draft Budget Proposals – Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio (18th February 2019);
 - Draft Public Space Protection Order – Control of Dogs (19th March 2019);
 - Parking Fines Appeals Policy (19th March 2019);
 - Pre Decision Scrutiny: LED Street Lighting on the Residential Highway Network (7th May 2019);
 - Shared Regulatory Services – Draft Business Plan 2019/20 (7th May 2019).

Over the year the Scrutiny Committee held twelve committee meetings and wrote 20 letters to the Cabinet, officers and external partners, sharing their comments/ recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings.

Members have attended a number of other scrutiny events, including work programming meetings, and pre-meetings prior to Committee and task & finish group meetings.

BRIEFING INFORMATION

Tree Management (5th June 2018)

The meeting on 5th June 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Tree Management'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Culture & Leisure and officers from the Economic Development Directorate. The purposed of the report was to review how Tree Management is delivered by the Council and to consider existing and potential future arrangements.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Culture & Leisure that included the following points:

- The Committee noted their concern at the reduction in tree management budget from £528,000 (including a one off payment £100,000 from the financial resilience mechanism) in 2017/18 to £431,530 in 2018/19 – an overall reduction of £96,470. In addition to this the income target for 2018/19 had increased by £5,000 which, given the £15,426 income shortfall for 2017/18, meant that the service needed to increase income by £20,426 in 2018/19. Members stated that keeping on top of the tree management backlog with a reduced budget and then delivering against an increased income target was a significant challenge.
- The Committee congratulated the Tree Management Service for the work that they have carried out to reduce tree related insurance claims made against the Council. The reduction from £45,333.96 in 2012/13 to £0 in 2016/17 had been impressive and illustrated that efficiencies had been achieved in this area.

Section 106 Local Infrastructure Proposals Lists - Member Briefing (3rd July 2018)

The meeting on 3rd July 2018 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Section 106 Local Infrastructure Proposals Lists - Member Briefing'. The reason for receiving the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on:

- The response to the report published by the Environmental Scrutiny Committee and presented to Cabinet in September 2017 entitled 'Management of Section 106 Funding for the Development of Community Projects'.
- To provide the Committee with an update on the development of the process for creating 'Section 106 Local Infrastructure Proposal Lists'. The outline process was due to go to Cabinet for approval on the 20th September 2018, and would ultimately help Councillors to identify local infrastructure projects that could potentially be funded through S106 contributions or other sources of funding.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Public Space Protection Orders – Dog Controls - Member Briefing (3rd July 2018)

The meeting on 3rd July 2018 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on an item titled 'Public Space Protection Orders – Dog Controls – Member Briefing'. The reason for receiving the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on the content of the Cabinet report titled 'Public Space Protection Orders – Dog Controls'. The main aims of the Cabinet report were:

- *To consider widening enforcement powers, in order to deliver a cleaner and more sustainable environment across Cardiff by supporting the use of Public Space Protection Orders as defined in Cardiff Council's Policy Statement;*
- *To consider authority to consult with members of the public and other relevant stakeholders to introduce a Public Spaces Protection Order (PSPO) under Section 59 of the Anti-Social Behaviour, Crime and Policing Act 2014. The purpose of the order is to improve and replace current outdated dog controls powers across the City of Cardiff.*

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Member Briefing: Second Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (4th September 2018)

The meeting on 4th September 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing: Second Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report'. The item was supported by an officer from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on the content of a Cabinet report titled 'Second Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report' that was presented to Cabinet at its meeting on Thursday 20th September 2018.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport, making the following key points:

- The Committee asked for further information on active retail units and vacancy rates within district and local shopping centres. In addition to this they asked how many shops in district shopping centres had become charity shops in the last few years.
- During the meeting a Member pointed out that the completion rate for new dwellings was below the target value set out in the Local Development Plan and Annual Monitoring Report. He was concerned that Cardiff had failed to meet the documented target and that achieving the overall plan total involved meeting annual targets to achieve a cumulative plan target. The Committee was concerned at this early shortfall and its potential longer-term effects and asked what could be done to ensure that the future target was achieved.
- A Member asked for details on House of Multiple Occupancy (HMO) planning applications for the last two years. This he felt would help the Committee assess the number submitted; the number accepted and rejected; the areas of the city where the applications are located; the

reasons provided for rejecting the applications and the number of successful and unsuccessful appeals.

- Upon review of the section on 'Delivery of Sustainable Transportation Infrastructure' the Committee noticed that several projects were ranked as amber and noted as 'On-hold' with an explanation of 'Subject to funding'; these included several 'Rapid Bus Corridors'. There was some concern about the delays for these important transport projects as they had been in the pipeline for a considerable period of time. Members felt that such transport projects were vitally important in the quest to increase modal shift to alternatives such as bus travel – a key part of our Local Development Plan and a Welsh Government priority. In the letter they asked for an explanation for the delays to these schemes.
- Topic area 'Achievement of 50:50 Modal Split' identified that sustainable travel in several areas relevant to modal shift had reduced during 2017. For example, travel for education had fallen from 59.6% in 2016 to 55.9% in 2017 – a reduction in 3.7%; travel for shopping (City Centre) had fallen from 67.9% in 2016 to 64.7% in 2017 – a reduction in 3.2%; travel for shopping (Other) had fallen from 45.6% in 2016 to 38.8% in 2017 – a reduction in 6.8%; and travel for leisure had fallen from 60.2% in 2016 to 56.4% in 2017 – a reduction in 3.8%. The Committee was concerned at these findings and asked for a detailed explanation for the reductions.
- During the meeting it was noted that work in progressing the identification of sites for permanent and transit Gypsy and Traveller sites had been delayed due to the need to undertake additional detailed site investigations. The detailed technical assessments had been completed and the Council was considering the implications of the findings of these assessments and ongoing flood defence works in order to determine options for taking this work forward. The work undertaken had included ongoing discussions with Welsh Government. The Committee asked for an update on the current position for identifying a future site.

Parking Enforcement Update (4th September 2018)

The meeting on 4th September 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Parking Enforcement Update'. The item was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to provide Members with an update on the Council approach to parking enforcement with particular reference to:

- The recent proposal of a 'Residents Parking Scheme – Virtual Permit';
- How civil parking enforcement resources are currently being targeted;
- The financial implications of parking enforcement and the wider Parking Revenue Account;
- The consistency of standards applied within parking enforcement and the level of flexibility allowed to Civil Parking Enforcement Officers when making decisions.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport, making the following key points:

- One of the key topics of conversation during the meeting was the recent Member consultation on e-permits for residential parking. Several concerns and questions were raised on the matter, resulting in Members seeking clarification on why the Member consultation took place during late July and mid-August 2018 when a large number of Members were on holiday; confirmation of the number of Member responses provided during the consultation exercise; details of any further consultation work required prior to piloting or rolling out e-permits for residential parking.
- The Committee would asked assurance that the consultation would fully explore the practicalities of applying blue badge holders and visitor permits to the e-permit scheme.

- That thought would be given to providing the public with a method of checking electronically to see if a vehicle is actually registered for a residential parking permit, for example, something similar to the DVLA database.
- During the meeting Members highlighted that enforcement should be used to change parking behaviour and, therefore, reduce the number of offences committed over time. The Committee requested that future reports should contain data to evaluate how effective enforcement has been – both locally and across Cardiff as a whole.

Planning, Transport & Environment – Budget Briefing (2nd October 2018)

The meeting on 2nd October 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Planning, Transport & Environment – Budget Briefing'. The item was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The report and presentation reviewed a number of aspects of the Directorate budget including the following:

- A progress update on how the Directorate had performed against its allocated budget for 2018/19;
- A progress update on how the Directorate had performing against the savings agreed during the 2018/19 budget setting process;
- Any in year financial pressures currently facing the Directorate;
- The scale of the proposed budget savings facing the Directorate in 2019/20 and beyond;
- The approach being taken to identify budget savings for 2019/20 and beyond.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent separate letters to the Cabinet Members for Strategic Planning & Transport and Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- The Committee expressed concern at a large range of problems facing the Directorate, including:
 - The Directorate was projected to be £1.424 million overspent by the end of the 2018/19 financial year and that £821,000 of the £1.838 million savings identified would probably not be achieved in year.
 - That the planned savings for 2019/20 were due to increase to £6.5 million.
 - That Recycling & Waste Management Services was projected to be overspent by £1.064 million at the end of the 2018/19 financial year

and that a large proportion of the in year savings identified for the service were unlikely to be achieved.

- That FTE sickness rates in Recycling & Waste Management Services were running at approximately 20 days per member of staff.
- That the ongoing fraud investigation within Recycling & Waste Management Services was having a financial impact on the in year budget position, along with an ongoing HMRC investigation into an underpaid landfill tax bill.
- That Fleet Services was projected to be overspent by £322,000 at the end of the 2018/19 financial year and that this was largely down to unachieved vehicle utilisation savings.
- That there were significant overspends from Planning & Building Control (£354,000) and in 'Cross Directorate Savings' (£222,000).
- The Committee decided to keep a close eye on the budget position and associated service delivery improvements that urgently needed to take place during the remainder of the financial year and asked for the following:
 - The Committee asked for details of specific actions that the Directorate was due to take to deal with the persistently high sickness rates.
 - Clawback Savings Shortfall - It was made clear to the Committee that it was unlikely that £821,000 of the £1.838 million of savings for 2018/19 would be achieved within the financial year, so asked for confirmation on how the Directorate might claw back the savings shortfall during the remainder of the 2018/19 financial year.
- Brexit - The Committee suggested that the Directorate should attempt to identify the associated key risks and determine a series of mitigating actions to address any problems that might be caused by Brexit.

- Confirmed Improvements - With particular reference to Recycling & Waste Management Services and Fleet Services, the Committee asked for examples of service improvement in areas such as sickness absence; control of overtime payments; budget management; quality of management information and better work process monitoring of the outputs produced.
- Service Reviews – The Committee asked for confirmation of when the service reviews for Recycling & Waste Management Services and Fleet Services would be complete, and requested that once they were complete that copies of the documents and any associated action plans / agreed timescales were made available.
- Sickness Costs - The Committee asked for a breakdown of costs associated with the high sickness rates for Recycling & Waste Management Services, including the full cost of sickness days lost and any associated overtime or agency costs paid for providing work cover.
- Overtime Payments - Members were told that a recent audit investigation had sampled a number of overtime payments for staff working within Recycling & Waste Management Services. Early indications suggested that a number overtime overpayments had been issued and so further investigation needed to take place. The Committee asked for an update on the findings of the further investigation into overtime overpayments.

Cardiff Cycling Programme Update (2nd October 2018)

The meeting on 2nd October 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff Cycling Programme Update'. The item was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to provide Members with an update on the ongoing development of Cardiff's cycling programme and in doing so to consider:

- Why is cycling important;
- Current and projected trends;
- Future development;
- Infrastructure plans;
- Partnership working;
- Cycling challenges in Cardiff; and,
- Cycling related 'Headline Actions' – Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate Delivery Plan 2018/19.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- Members commented that failing to include cycling infrastructure in the new section of the Eastern Bay Link had been a missed opportunity and that in future the Council should look to include cycling infrastructure in all new roads built in the city.
- Members asked for an explanation of where the increase in new cyclists had come from and the net impact that this change had on overall modal shift, for example, were the new cyclists former walkers or bus users.
- The Committee supported the lobbying of the Welsh Government to increase spending in cycling from £4 per head to £20 per head.

- Members commented on the lack of consistency across the city around cycle lane and sign markings. They felt that this lack of consistency was confusing for cyclists, motorists and pedestrians, and recommended that the Council developed a single cycling sign and lane marking standard for Cardiff.

Member Briefing Note: Road Naming Policy (6th November 2018)

The meeting on 6th November 2018 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing Note: Road Naming Policy'. The purpose of the Cabinet report was to:

- To recommend the approval of the draft Street Naming Policy for consultation. The City of Cardiff Council ("the Council") has statutory responsibilities and powers, within the context of adoptive legislation, for the naming of streets, alteration of street names and indication of street names. The Council also has additional discretionary powers to provide a number or name to a property.
- Street naming and numbering has a number of important functions, for example, wayfinding, efficient delivery of mail and ensuring the emergency services can locate properties quickly.
- Street naming is also a key element of place-making, and it is important in the context of the Council's commitments to the Well-being of Future Generations Act and Welsh Language Standards. Ensuring that the naming of new streets in Cardiff reflects local heritage, with names for new developments which are historically, culturally and linguistically linked, will help to deliver on the national well-being goal, 'A Wales of vibrant culture and thriving Welsh Language'.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Improving Public Transport – Response to Welsh Government White Paper (Paving Report) (19th March 2019)

The meeting on 19th March 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on an item titled ‘Improving Public Transport – Response to Welsh Government White Paper (Paving Report)’. The reason for receiving the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on the Council’s response to the Welsh Government’s White Paper Consultation, “Improving Public Transport”.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

INQUIRIES

Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled Restore Our Rivers (5 June 2018)

The meeting on 5 June 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled Restore Our Rivers. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided and following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member that included the following points:

- The Committee thanked the Cabinet Member for his positive response to the recommendations made in the Restore Our Rivers report. In the letter Members identified that the Cabinet Member had suggested that the Committee should consider revisiting the recommendations of the report by inviting the other partner organisations to the report back to Committee during the 2018/19 municipal year.

Managing Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff

During 2018/19 the Committee worked on an inquiry titled 'Managing Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff'. Scoping meetings took place in March and April 2018 and a terms of reference for the inquiry was agreed. This is set out below:

- *To undertake comparative analysis and benchmarking on how other local authorities manage litter & fly tipping, with the main aim of identifying best practice. The comparative analysis and benchmarking should focus on the performance of core cities, Welsh local authorities and cities with a large student population.*
- *To undertake a detailed survey on litter & fly tipping to test public perception on how they feel about litter, fly tipping and wider street cleanliness in Cardiff.*
- *To arrange a number of Member visits to frontline street cleansing and waste enforcement services to help gain a better understanding of the work that they carry out and everyday challenges that they face.*
- *To compare Cardiff's performance in terms of managing litter & fly tipping against best practice identified in the comparative analysis and benchmarking.*

The task & finish report was completed in February 2019, and in doing this the Committee undertook and delivered the following:

- 5 task group meetings;
- 11 separate witness sessions;
- Dealing with 26 witnesses (21 external to the Council);
- Worked closely with the Cabinet Members and Council staff who are responsible for managing litter and fly tipping;
- Five Committee Members took part in a front line job shadowing exercise with staff responsible for managing litter and fly tipping. This included job

shadowing with the City Centre Team; the Street Cleansing Team; the Waste Education & Enforcement Team and the Fly Tipping Team;

- Ran a well supported volunteer workshop designed to gather the views of Cardiff's litter picking volunteers;
- Produced a Scrutiny Research report titled 'Local Authority Arrangements (2018) in Managing Litter & Fly Tipping';
- Delivered a Litter & Fly Tipping Survey to test public opinion on a range of litter and fly tipping issues – this was completed by 3,433 local people.

In concluding the task & finish exercise made a series of detailed key findings recommendations based on the following themes:

- Resource Allocation & Technology;
- Enforcement & Fines;
- Education & Awareness;
- Bins; Volunteering;
- Litter in General;
- Fast Food;
- Fly Tipping;
- Dog Fouling;
- Smoking Litter;
- Chewing Gum.

The inquiry report has been submitted to for consideration at a future Cabinet meeting. The initial informal response from the Cabinet Member and supporting officers has been very positive. An item to consider a future Cabinet response will hopefully be timetabled into the Environmental Scrutiny Committee work programme for 2019/20.

Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Inquiry Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'

During 2017/18 the delivered a task & finish exercise titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'. The terms of reference for the exercise is set out below:

The aim of the inquiry is to provide Members with the opportunity to explore and consider how the Council can help to improve air quality in Cardiff. This will include reviewing:

- *The current air quality position;*
- *The development of Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy;*
- *The Welsh Government Position on Air Quality;*
- *Transportation;*
- *Other Pollution Sources;*
- *Planning & Development;*
- *Sustainable Fuels;*
- *Clean Air Zones.*

The work of the task & finish group was extensive and delivering the 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' task & finish exercise involved nine task group meetings; 17 separate witness sessions; dealing with 38 expert witnesses (26 external to the Council and 12 internal to the Council); working closely with the Cabinet Members and Council staff developing Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy; Scrutiny Research reports on best practice in 'Clean Air Zones' and an emissions review of Cardiff's public sector fleet and consideration of the areas being used to structure Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy.

The report made a series of key findings and 31 recommendations designed to help improving Cardiff's Air Quality. Some of the main themes generated by the recommendations included:

- Putting public health at the heart of Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy – air pollution causes approximately 40,000 premature deaths in the UK each year;
- Creating a low emission zone in Westgate Street by focusing on reducing Nitrogen Dioxide emissions from diesel buses;
- Pushing for more sustainable fuel infrastructure for Cardiff to support the growth in the use of low emission vehicles, for example, electric and hydrogen;
- Greater regional planning with neighbouring local authorities organisations to help reduce emissions caused by commuter travel;
- Accelerating public transport and active travel infrastructure, for example, more bus and cycle lanes;
- Using short term initiatives within the Council's control to drive modal shift, for example, 20 mph zones and resident parking schemes;
- Leading by example, for example, switching the Council fleet to low emission vehicles and building the use of low emission fuels into the Council procurement process.

The inquiry report was received by Cabinet at their meeting on the 20th September 2018. At the point of writing this report, a Cabinet response has yet to be provided.

Managing the Natural Environment & Biodiversity in Cardiff

In April 2019 the Committee agreed to start an inquiry titled 'Managing the Natural Environment & Biodiversity in Cardiff'. The scoping of the initial inquiry and initial meeting took place in April 2019, the terms of reference for the inquiry is set out below:

The aim of the inquiry is to provide Members with the opportunity to explore and consider how the Council can support and help improve the biodiversity in Cardiff. In particular this will include scrutiny of:

- *The development of Cardiff's Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, its structure, aims and objectives;*
- *The ongoing implications of Cardiff's Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, future reporting and monitoring of the document;*
- *The approach taken by other Welsh local authorities to develop biodiversity forward plans and to identify best practice in this area;*
- *The Council's current role, obligations and statutory / legislative requirements for supporting and improving biodiversity;*
- *The importance of Cardiff's biodiversity and ecosystems;*
- *The resources available to support and improve biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *Community collaboration and other partnership working approaches to understand how they help support and enhance biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *The importance of raising awareness of biodiversity issues in Cardiff – internally, with key stakeholders and the public;*
- *Cardiff's Green Infrastructure Strategy – including the benefits of green infrastructure and ecosystem services;*
- *Green Infrastructure Management – including the Green Infrastructure Group;*

- *Cardiff Green Infrastructure SPG and Planned Development;*
- *The Green Infrastructure Spatial Strategy;*
- *Green Infrastructure Implementation Programme (Pollinators Action Plan, Individual Park Management Plans, Local Nature Plan, River Corridors, Tree Strategy, Cross border initiatives, other plans & projects);*
- *Sustainable drainage – links with the SuDS Approval Body process.*

The Committee will look to deliver this work during the first half of the 2019/20 municipal year.

PERFORMANCE MONITORING

Shared Regulatory Services – Business Plan 2018/19 & Annual Report 2017/18 (5th June 2018)

The meeting on the 5th June 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Shared Regulatory Services – Business Plan 2018/19 & Annual Report 2017/18'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from Shared Regulatory Services. The purposed of the report was to consider the plans for the service during 2018/19 and review its performance during 2017/18.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- The Committee was pleased with the progress that the Shared Regulatory Service had achieved during 2017/18 and the proposals contained within its business plan for 2018/19. In particular, Members felt that the service had done well to deliver its role within budget and to score well against the vast majority of performance indicators.
- Members noted the twelve redundancies that were required from the service to meet its budget savings for the financial year 2019/20. They were concerned that the redundancies could have a negative impact on service delivery and agreed to closely monitor the effect that this had on service delivery.
- At the meeting Members raised some concerns about the Trading Standards performance indicator result 'SRS/TS/002' that was risk rated as either 'Red' or 'Amber' across each of the partner local authority areas in 2017/18. Shared Regulatory Service officers commented that this was both a frustrating and misleading indicator for the service as any new

cases opened towards the end of the financial year needed to be completed before the end of that financial year. The Committee agreed with the Shared Regulatory Service officers and felt that it should be possible to develop a better indicator that didn't focus on completion by a single date. The Committee asked that the performance indicator was reviewed so that a more meaningful outcome is recorded, for example, using rolling year basis and then measuring the number of cases completed within a specific timescale.

Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate Delivery Plan 2018/19 (3rd July 2018)

The meeting on the 3rd July 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate Delivery Plan 2018/19'. The item was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was:

- To enable Members to gain an overview of the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate services and its contributions to the Council's Corporate Plan, its key achievements during the previous year and an outline of the future challenges facing the directorate. The report provided the Committee with an opportunity to gain an understanding of the operation of the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate and its key priorities for this year.

Following discussion, questions and comments Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Members for Strategic Planning & Transport and Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members asked if there had been any progress in identifying a site for a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in the north of Cardiff. It was explained that Strategic Estates were looking into the matter and hoped to provide the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate with details of a potential site within six to eight weeks. Due to commercial sensitivity, it was not possible to provide any more detail at the meeting. The Committee asked that they were provided with a briefing as soon as a formal position was agreed.
- The Committee was disappointed to see that sickness rates had increased across the Council and that during 2017/18 every single directorate failed to meet their full time equivalent days lost per person target. In particular, the Committee was concerned that sickness rates were higher in 2017/18

for the former City Operations Directorate and Economic Development Directorate than they were in 2016/17. They asked for a summary of sickness rates by team for all of the parts of the newly formed Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate.

- A Member asked if the introduction of the recently introduced Nextbike scheme had been a success. The Director for Planning, Transport & Environment explained that the launch had been a success with Cardiff outperforming most of the other cities that had introduced the Nextbike scheme. He explained that each bike was being used at least four times a day, which was a very promising start. The Committee welcomed the positive comments and asked for details of the scheme including the total number of bikes in operation; the number of people that have signed up to use the scheme; the number of times the bikes are used each day; the total revenue generated and the most popular location(s) for bike hire.
- During the way forward a Member commented that the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate Delivery Plan 2018/19 contained planning indicators that measured the percentage of affordable housing at completion stage provided in a development on brownfield and greenfield sites (PLA/011 & PLA/012), however, there was nothing explicit in the document to record the percentage of properties required as a result of the Local Development Plan to be built to enable older people to remain in their own homes. The Committee asked for confirmation of if such an indicator existed.

Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & 4 Performance Reports 2017/18 (3rd July 2018)

During 2018/19 the Committee received quarterly performance monitoring reports for Quarters 3 and 4 of 2017/18. These focused on the performance of services provided by the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The main comments made during the quarterly performance monitoring scrutiny were:

- Members asked if there had been any progress in identifying a site for a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in the north of Cardiff. They were told that Strategic Estates was looking into the matter and hoped to provide the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate with details of a potential site in the next six to eight weeks. The Committee, while understanding the commercial sensitivities of such a proposal, asked for a briefing as soon as a formal position was agreed.
- The Committee was disappointed to see that sickness rates had increased across the Council, and that during 2017/18 every single directorate failed to meet their full time equivalent days lost per person target. In particular, the Committee was concerned that sickness rates were higher in 2017/18 for the former City Operations Directorate and Economic Development Directorate than they were in 2016/17. Having stated their concern the Committee asked for a summary of sickness rates by team for all of the parts of the newly formed Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. They asked that this should include Quarterly summaries for 2016/17 and 2017/18:
 - A breakdown of long and short-term sickness for 2016/17 and 2017/18;
 - Details of any seasonal fluctuations in sickness during 2016/17 and 2017/18;
 - A summary of the main causes of sickness;

- Examples of best practice that were being reviewed by the Council for reducing sickness rates from local authorities, other public bodies and the private sector;
 - Details of the plan that the newly formed Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was developing to help reduce sickness rates.
- It was noted at the meeting that the Economic Development Directorate ran a budget shortfall of £1.642m during 2017/18. Members asked the Director for Planning, Transport & Environment if the financial challenges of this shortfall would transfer into the newly formed directorate with the services coming across from the Economic Development Directorate. He explained that inheriting parts of the shortfall would be a challenge and that staff from his area were working with Finance to fully assess the consequences and develop a plan to address the potential financial shortfall. The Committee expressed their concern and hoped that a zero based cost accounting approach that the Directorate was looking to deliver would produce a better outcome for the Council.

Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 1 & 2 Performance Reports 2018/19 (4th December 2018)

During 2018/19 the Committee received quarterly performance monitoring reports for Quarters 1 and 2 of 2018/19. This focused on the performance of services within the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The main comments made during the quarterly performance monitoring scrutiny were:

- **Sickness** – Members were very concerned at the ongoing high sickness rates within key services in the Directorate. The letter explained that in recent years they had repeatedly been told that managers were dealing with high sickness rates by closely following the Council's Sickness & Absence Policy, however, the problem persisted and was actually getting worse. The Committee asked that if the sickness policy was being applied properly then why wasn't it delivering the necessary improvements to sickness rates. They asked the Cabinet Member to provide details of additional actions that the Council was able to apply, over and above the existing Council Sickness Absence Policy that might help the Directorate reduce sickness rates.
- **Recycling & Waste Management Services** – During the meeting the ongoing concerns of Recycling & Waste Management Services were once again raised. The Director of the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate explained that they are in the process of delivering a new restructure across the whole service and that this should result in improvements. He hoped that the restructure would be complete by the end of the 2018/19 financial year. Given the apparent lack of control in some parts of the service caused by reductions in management, the Committee felt that the new restructure should include details to drive improvements around governance and control. The Committee asked for a paving report in April 2019 that set out the full details of the restructure.
- **Recycling** – Members were told that the Council would need to identify an additional 20,000 tonnes of recycling to achieve the statutory Welsh

Government recycling target of 64% by 2019/20. The Committee asked for details of which waste streams the additional recycling would come from, with particular reference to how much might come from Household Waste Recycling Centres.

- **Technology Roll Out** – At the meeting there was some conversation around the roll out of technology to drive efficiencies and how this might contribute to future savings. The Director for Planning, Transport & Environment agreed to provide the Committee with an update of the various pieces of technology currently being rolled out by the Directorate to help improve front line services, for example, Bartec and Civica Tranman.

POLICY REVIEW

Recycling & Waste Management Strategy Update (6th November 2018)

The meeting on 6th November 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Recycling & Waste Management Strategy Update'. The item was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to provide Members with a progress update on the changes being applied to Cardiff's Waste Management Strategy. The Committee was asked to reflect on the comments of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee from 15 May 2018, the decisions taken by Cabinet on the 17 May 2018 and other factors that have since emerged that will have an impact on the development of Cardiff's Recycling & Waste Management Strategy. These included:

- The Recycling & Waste Management Strategy related comments and observations contained within previous the Environmental Scrutiny Committee letters.
- The further expansion of the provision of wheeled bins in the city;
- The provision of Household Waste Recycling Centre (HWRC) education stations;
- The pilot scheme for the collection of domestic glass waste for recycling, separate to other household waste collections;
- The results of the citywide consultation for the Recycling & Waste Management Strategy 2018-21 – this included sections on the key change proposals in the draft strategy, new infrastructure requirements, service standards and other proposals to help meet statutory targets for recycling;
- The ongoing work to develop the Council's approach to the management of single use plastics.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members were supportive of the idea of closed loop recycling, particularly if materials could be processed closer to home. They encouraged the Cabinet Member to lobby and work with the Welsh Government to help achieve this goal.
- The Committee asked for confirmation if the Council's Commercial Waste Service currently charges VAT on all transactions to businesses and members of the public, and if there were any VAT advantages for local authority commercial waste services.
- Members emphasised that private commercial waste companies were not required to follow the same statutory recycling targets that are placed against local authority waste services, this creates a challenge for local authority waste collection services who have to declare all commercial waste materials against the current statutory recycling target of 58% (soon to increase to 64% in 2019/20). The Committee was concerned that commercial waste providers in Wales only achieve recycling rates of 29% - this is bad for the environment and provides them a commercial advantage. Members asked what could be practically done to close this gap and to create a more level playing field.

Joint Meeting: Public Spaces Protection Order: Proposed Dog Controls (11th November 2018)

The meeting on the 11th November 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Joint Meeting: Public Spaces Protection Order: Proposed Dog Controls'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Members for Culture & Leisure and Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; officers from the Economic Development and Planning, Transport & Environment Directorates and some back bench Elected Members and representatives from Guide Dogs Cymru, the RSPCA and Cardiff Dog Action. The purposed of the report was to consider the content of the Cabinet paper on 'Public Spaces Protection Orders – Dog Controls' and the recent public consultation exercise on 'Public Spaces Protection Orders (PSPOs) – Proposed Dog Controls' that ended on the 22nd October 2018. In particular the scrutiny looked at:

- The delivery of the public consultation exercise;
- The results and findings of the public consultation exercise;
- Feedback from key stakeholders and the public on the public consultation exercise, its range of proposals and future proposals;
- A range of potential options that the Council could take to address any concerns about dog control that were identified in the Cabinet paper and public consultation exercise.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members for Culture & Leisure and Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- The Committee asked that the Council produced a statement clarifying that people can still walk dogs in Cardiff's parks. It was felt that reminding the public of the current position would reduce confusion and prevent unnecessary disagreements between dog walkers and other park users.

- During the meeting a representative from Guide Dogs Cymru stated that the Council should have produced an Equality Impact Assessment on the Public Space Protection Order – Control of Dogs proposals prior to starting the consultation exercise. This he felt might have helped to identify some of the concerns that were later raised by the public and other stakeholders. The Committee agree with this and recommend that an Equality Impact Assessment be completed before any draft Public Space Protection Order proposals were brought forward.

- An important part of the scope of the scrutiny was to identify 'potential options that the Council could take to address concerns about dog control'. The Committee suggested that the Council should explore the following ideas:
 - The introduction of the Green Dog Walkers Scheme to Cardiff – one Member suggested that this could potentially be introduced alongside the 'Love Where You Live Campaign'.
 - The roll out of community poo bag dispenser schemes that could be paid for by sponsorship from local companies, for example, veterinary practices.
 - Increased and improved communication on dog fouling and control – this communication should be targeted at key stakeholders including veterinary practices, dog owners groups and social media.
 - Educational campaigns based on dog fouling and control aimed at schools – it is easier to teach lifelong habits at a young age.
 - South Wales Police is one of the responsible bodies that holds powers to enforce against dog fouling and other dog control matters. They should be encouraged by the Council to take more action in enforcing against these anti-social problems.
 - Effective enforcement against dog fouling was described as an almost impossible problem due to the small number of Council staff authorised to deal with the contravention. The Committee recommend that the Council undertake some research to identify local authority best practice in managing dog fouling. Once this is done the information

gathered should be used to help improve the Council's approach to managing dog fouling.

- A Member suggested that the Council should undertake further collaborative work with Keep Wales Tidy to help manage and address the problem of dog fouling.
- In response to comments made about the lack of enforcement resources in parks, the Chair of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee reminded Cabinet Members of Recommendation 11 from the Economy & Culture 'Funding of Parks'.

Air Quality – Progress Update (19th March 2019)

The meeting on 19th March 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Air Quality – Progress Update'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Social Care, Health & Well-being and Strategic Planning & Transport, along with officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to provide the Committee with an update on:

- The work being undertaken to ensure that Cardiff complies with the statutory EU air quality targets in the shortest time possible; and,
- Consider the content of a report titled 'Air Quality Feasibility Study Outline Business Case – Welsh Government Direction' that was due to be received by Cabinet on the 21st March 2019.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- The Committee was supportive of many of the proposed measures that the Council was planning to introduced to help achieve air quality compliance in the '*shortest time possible*', for example, the introduction of 36 electric buses is very good news for Cardiff, as is the revised taxi policy and the ongoing commitment to improving cycling infrastructure in the city.
- **Cardiff Wide Air Quality Improvements** - The Committee felt that the main focus of the report was achieving air quality compliance below the 40 µg/m³ target in the '*shortest time possible*', when instead it should have been about doing everything that we can to improve air quality across all of Cardiff in the '*shortest time possible*'. They stated that efforts had been directed at achieving air quality improvements in and around the city centre, with a number of measures being removed from further assessment in the Outline Business Case as they were either not deliverable or in the vicinity of the immediate problem. In addition to this,

delivery of the much needed key infrastructure projects such as the rapid transport bus routes did not appear to be progressing. In short, the Members felt that the motivation for this piece of work should have been to improve air quality across all of Cardiff to produce health benefits for all residents. It should have been supported by a clear commitment to drive modal shift and a citywide set of actions to help achieve this goal.

- **Particulate Matter** – The Committee stated that the main focus of the report was to reduce nitrogen dioxide emissions. This was described as a very important goal as nitrogen dioxide has a very negative impact on human health, however, other pollutants such as particulate matter were also a major health concern. They explained that electric taxis and buses will significantly reduce nitrogen dioxide, but the mechanical actions of these vehicles (for example, braking) will still produce large quantities of particulate matter. Members, therefore, they recommended that Cardiff's Air Quality Strategy needed to include a greater commitment to reducing particulate matter levels.

Highways Resurfacing Programme (2nd April 2019)

The meeting on 2nd April 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Highways Resurfacing Programme'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to provide the Committee with an opportunity to ask questions on the current Planned Maintenance Identified Scheme List and the methodology that is used to prioritise the highways schemes for this list.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- In previous years, when the 'Highways Resurfacing Programme' was published the complete list of schemes in Cardiff was provided to all Members. This didn't happen in 2018/19 and Members were only provided with details of schemes in their wards; this made it difficult to find out where the Council was planning to carry out other highways resurfacing work. Members felt that receiving information for all of Cardiff was particularly useful since, for example, it helped them identify schemes that might have a direct impact on their ward. The Committee asked that all Members were provided with a complete list of the 'Highways Resurfacing Programme' for 2019/20.
- Members asked for an opportunity to scrutinise the 2019/20 'Highways Resurfacing Programme' prior to publication so that they could review the proposals and provide feedback.

During the meeting a Member asked what happened to the proposed schemes that were included on the 'long list' for 2018/19, and asked if these would be prioritised for the 'Highways Resurfacing Programme' in 2019/20. An officer explained that the proposed schemes would be reconsidered for the 2019/20 'Highways Resurfacing Programme', however, they would be

assessed against other proposed schemes. Members understood the rationale of the response, but for the purposes of clarity asked for:

- A copy of the 2018/19 'long list' for the 'Highways Resurfacing Programme';
- A copy of the process that is used when creating the 'Highways Resurfacing Programme' that included detail on how schemes on the 'long list' were managed from year to year.

Lamby Way Solar Farm – Progress Update (2nd April 2019)

The meeting on 2nd April 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Lamby Way Solar Farm – Progress Update'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and an officer from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to provide the Committee with an update on the progress of the Lamby Way Solar Farm project and to detail the next steps in the delivery of this scheme.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment which included the following points:

- The Committee was very supportive of this project and felt that it would be a great addition to the Council's existing infrastructure which would produce sustainable electric, help reduce Cardiff's carbon footprint and generate much needed income.
- Members were concerned about the potential impact on the level of biodiversity in and around the site, so they asked for further detail on the work that had been undertaken support and enhance biodiversity in and around the proposed solar farm.

Members were concerned that the prospect of 'Brexit' and potential currency fluctuations associated with this change might impact on the viability of the solar farm. They asked for assurance that the potential risks presented by 'Brexit' had been mitigated and that it would not prevent the delivery of the scheme.

Planning, Transport & Environment – Directorate Delivery Plan – 2019/20 (7th May 2019)

The meeting on 7th May 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Planning, Transport & Environment – Directorate Delivery Plan – 2019/20'. The item was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to talk Members through the proposals contained within the Planning, Transport & Environment – Directorate Delivery Plan – 2019/20.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letters to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport which included the following points:

- The Committee asked for a progress update on the delivery of ward based action plans. They were told that these would be delivered within six months, however, they would be area based rather than ward based. An officer went on to explain that the roll out had been delayed to ensure that the area based action plans were developed using accurate information. Members asked for confirmation of the start date for the area based action plans, along with details on the services involved and geographical boundaries allocated for each action plan. In addition to this the Committee asked for the roll out of the scheme to be made available for scrutiny before the end of 2019.
- Members asked during this item what could be done to improve the accuracy and speed of waste data collected for both commercial and domestic waste streams. An officer explained that it was possible to tell immediately how much overall waste was collected, however, waste data flow needed actual quantities for specific materials – to make this more complicated, for the material to count towards recycling figures it had to be supported by a processing receipt. Members then asked if it was possible to provide recycling statistics by ward and were told that it was not. This

created some confusion during the way forward as several Members seemed to think that they had been shown ward based recycling rates in the past. Members asked for confirmation if it was still possible to provide ward based recycling rates, and if it wasn't possible to provide an explanation as to what has changed since ward based recycling rates were published in the past.

- One of the Members asked a question about the large number of missed collections that recently took place on a Saturday after the bank holiday in North Cardiff. In particular, he referred to the fact that after raising a query on the matter it took twelve days for an officer response. He was told that there had been issues with vehicle breakdowns, staff availability and sickness, with the officer then explaining that an action plan was being developed to prevent such an event happening in future. Members asked the Cabinet Member to provide the Committee with a copy of the action plan once it was completed.

Shared Regulatory Services Business – Draft Business Plan 2019/20 (7th May 2019)

The meeting on 7th May 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Shared Regulatory Services Business – Draft Business Plan 2019/20'. The item was supported the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Housing & Communities; the Chair of Licensing & Public Protection and officers from the Shared Regulatory Service. The purposed of the report was to talk Members through the proposals contained within Shared Regulatory Services Business – Draft Business Plan 2019/20.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Housing & Communities and the Chair of Licensing & Public Protection which included the following points:

- Members were concerned to hear that the service had experienced some recent issues around recruitment and retention, particularly for the Food Hygiene Service that was in the process of recruiting five new officers to replace staff who had left to pursue other employment opportunities. They hoped that the current recruitment process was successful and that the temporary reduction in staff did not have a negative impact on the Food Hygiene Service's ability to carry out all of the necessary visits. They asked that the Shared Regulatory Service undertake a short review to assess what could be done to prevent such a sudden loss of staff in future.
- The Committee was concerned that the future of the 'Out of Hours' service looked uncertain due to financial and other pressures. Members felt that this is an important service, which if lost would make it difficult to tackle a wide range of late night anti-social behaviour.

PRE DECISION SCRUTINY

Clamping & Removal of Nuisance Vehicles from Highway & Public Land (6th November 2018)

The meeting on 6th November 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Clamping & Removal of Nuisance Vehicles from Highway & Public Land'. The item was supported by an officer from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to consider the introduction of a new policy for the clamping and removal of the following nuisance vehicles, with particular reference to:

- Vehicles owned by persistent offenders and evaders of parking and traffic tickets;
- Vehicles causing an immediate obstruction and /or parked contrary to parking regulations;
- Vehicles with no registered keeper on DVLA records;
- Vehicles that are not taxed in accordance with the Vehicle Excise and Registration Act 1994.

Following discussion, questions and comments, the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport, making the following key points:

- The Committee was supportive of the proposed working arrangement with the DVLA for the Clamping and Removal of Nuisance Vehicles from Highway and Public Land. In delivering the scheme they asked that a fair process for prioritising resources for clamping and removal was developed and implemented from the start, i.e. that the resources for the clamping and removal of vehicles was fairly shared across all of Cardiff's wards.
- They asked for a progress report by the end of the 2018/19 financial year outlining the progress of the new working partnership.

Draft Budget Proposals 2019/20 – Corporate Overview (18th February 2019)

The meeting on 18 February 2019 provided the Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the 'Draft Corporate Plan 2019 to 2022 & 2019/20 Draft Budget Proposals'. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment, Strategic Planning & Transport and Finance, Modernisation & Performance were invited to the meeting. They were supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate.

The letter sent after the meeting to the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation and Performance addressed the content of the whole meeting and included the following points:

Corporate Overview

- **Capital Programme & Future Revenue Budget Pressures** – During the meeting Members asked how sustainable the Council's proposed Capital Programme was over the next five years, and questioned the impact that this might have on a wide range of services funded through the revenue budget. The five year capital programme contained just over £843 million in proposals; much of which needs to be repaid by funds from the Council's revenue budget. An officer explained to the Committee that the current proposals are both affordable and sustainable; however, further expansion of the Capital Programme could place large pressures on the Council's finances. Given the current financial challenges facing the Council, the Committee stated that all future capital investment decisions should be based on prudence and supported by a robust business case. They felt that capital investment should be self-funding in the long term and used as a catalyst for the ongoing provision of important front line services.

- **Achieving Savings** – The month six budget report indicated that only £11.24 million of the Council's £14.296 million savings would be delivered during 2018/19; this meant that the Council was projecting an overall savings shortfall of £3.056 million for 2018/19. The Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate in particular had struggled to achieve savings in 2018/19 with a projected savings shortfall of approximately 40%. The Committee was disappointed at the results and asked for assurance that the 2019/20 savings proposals would be better planned and deliverable than those presented in the 2018/19 budget. This was particularly important given the £19.157 million savings required for 2019/20.

Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals

2019/20 – Corporate Overview

- **Highways Investment – Financial Resilience Mechanism** – Members were told that the Financial Resilience Mechanism for 2019/20 had allocated £1 million for 'localised highway asset improvement works' and £250,000 for 'road signs and lines'. This was in addition to the £1.477 million added into the Highways budget using the same mechanism. Members questioned why the Council was continually funding the highways infrastructure with a temporary funding measure instead of building additional funds into the base budget. The Committee felt that this approach would provide Highways officers with a better opportunity to plan instead of having to wait each year to see how much they might receive from the Financial Resilience Mechanism.
- **Clamping & Removal of Nuisance Vehicles** - The Committee scrutinised the new working arrangement in November 2018 and were informed that the service would commence in January 2019. At the meeting, Members were told that there had been delays in the implementation of the scheme due to 'slippage', which left them concerned about the deliverability of the saving. In response to this they asked for an explanation as to why projected start date had been delayed, when it was anticipated that the

scheme would begin and if the £120,000 saving would be delivered in 2019/20.

- **Welsh Government Sustainable Transport Investment** – Members were pleased to see significant capital investment in the Capital Programme for the delivery of sustainable transport initiatives, for example, £10.852 million from the ‘Local Transport Fund’, £950,000 for the roll out of 20mph zones and £5.5million for new cycling infrastructure. Members acknowledged that such investment was not something that the Council could achieve on its own; therefore, felt that thanks should be passed onto the Welsh Government for their valuable support.

Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2018/19 – Corporate Overview

- **Zonal Cleansing** – Members were told that the Council was in the process of developing a new zonal cleansing approach that was being piloted in St Mellons. Several Members were surprised at this since no wider Member engagement had taken place on the proposals. They were told that wider Member engagement would take place should the proposals be taken further. The Committee welcomed this and recommended that local councillor engagement should happen well in advance of any zonal cleansing roll out.
- **Cardiff North Household Waste Recycling Centre** – The Committee was very interested in the progress of the Cardiff North Household Waste Recycling Centre and asked for a progress update to be made available to scrutiny in advance of any paper on the topic being presented at Cabinet.
- **Achieving Recycling Targets** – The issue of reaching the future recycling target of 64% was discussed at the meeting. Officers ran through a series of measures that they are looking to implement in the coming year to achieve this target, and commented on additional challenges that they currently face in the area of recycling, for example, the potential of a

complete change in the structure of the recycling targets. Members after the meeting Members asked if officers could provide the Committee with:

- A summary of the actions that they are proposing to use to increase recycling rates and the anticipated impact that they hope that these will have;
- Any plans that the Council has created to deal with any changes in Welsh Government recycling targets.

Draft Public Space Protection Order – Control of Dogs (19th March 2019)

The meeting on 19th March 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Draft Public Space Protection Order – Control of Dogs'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Members for Culture & Leisure and Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. External witnesses from the RSPCA and Cardiff Dog Action also took part in the meeting, while contributions were made by a number of other Elected Members. The purposed of the report was to:

- *Provide the Committee with an opportunity to carry out pre decision scrutiny on the introduction of a Public Space Protection Order for Dog Controls under Section 59 of the Anti-Social Behaviour, Crime and Policing Act 2014 and to review the policy document for Public Space Protection Orders.*

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a was letter to the Cabinet Members for Culture & Leisure and Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment making the following key points:

- It was clear during the meeting that both Members of the Committee and witnesses were satisfied at the proposals for the new Public Space Protection Order for the Control of Dogs. They felt that the Cabinet had addressed the main concerns raised during the consultation exercise and had produced a sound set of proposals to address dog fouling in the city.
- That the Public Space Protection Order made a number of appropriate exceptions against the application of the policy, for example, excluding the owners of assistance and guide dogs from prosecution. Therapy dogs were not included on this list, and the Committee recommended that they should be added to the list.

- The Committee was not convinced that the Council and its partners has the necessary capacity to deliver the required enforcement to support the new powers. Members asked for a summary of all of the enforcement resources available to support the new Public Space Protection Order and detail on how these resources might be maximised.
- One of the public priorities identified in the consultation exercise was better provision of bins to help reduce dog fouling. Given that this is a public priority, the Committee asked for a plan on how the Council planned to address this concern.

Parking Fines Appeals Policy (19th March 2019)

The meeting on 19th March 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Parking Fines Appeals Policy'. The item was supported by an officer from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to:

- Review the introduction of a new policy for challenges, representations and appeals policy associated with Civil Parking enforcement and Moving Traffic Offences. To support scrutiny Members were provided with a copy of the draft policy titled 'Challenges, Representations & Appeals Policy – The Traffic Management Act Policy 2004'.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a was letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport stating that:

- *The Members of the Committee agreed that the new Challenges, Representations & Appeals Policy was a positive step forward. They felt that it provided a clear and concise structure for processing all future appeals, while allowing a degree of flexibility for dealing with the more complicated cases. The Committee would like to pass on their thanks to the staff who were involved in creating this important and well written document.*

Pre Decision Scrutiny: LED Street Lighting on Residential Highway Network (7th May 2019)

The meeting on 7th May 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: LED Street Lighting on Residential Highway Network'. The item was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to:

- Review the proposal to roll out LED street lighting across Cardiff's highway network prior to it being received by Cabinet on the 16th May.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport stating that:

- Members were supportive of the scheme to roll out LED street lighting across Cardiff's residential highway network. They felt that it would generate savings, reduce carbon emissions and add to the Councils credentials as an organisation that is supporting the declaration of a climate emergency.
- The Committee felt that the savings proposals and modelling provided were very conservative based on the consistent rise of energy prices over the last 20 years. Given the ongoing need to achieve budget savings, the Committee suggested adding in a small assumed increase in the 'Financial Benefits – Cashable' across the 17 year period of the business model. They felt that the assumed savings should then be built into the medium term financial plan for the Directorate to assist with future budget savings.
- Members were told that all of the street lights on the residential highway network would be converted to LED as a result of the proposed procurement exercise, with the exception of the street lights under the control of Parks and Housing. It was explained that these had not been added to the procurement proposal because the service area does not

have control over this lighting, or the required information to include them within the exercise. Members felt that it was a scheme that would generate income and help to reduce carbon emissions, therefore, the Council should act as a single body and adds the Parks and Housing stock to the procurement exercise.

RECOMMENDED FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items for inclusion on the work programme, and suggest any new issues that may be of interest to the Committee. The following items have been identified during 2018/19 as suitable items for discussion during the 2019/20 work programming process:

- Cardiff's Bus Routes & Services;
- Lamby Way Solar Farm – Member Update;
- Highways Resurfacing Programme;
- Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report;
- Shared Regulatory Service Annual Report 2019/20 & Business Plan 2020/21;
- Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2019 to 2022;
- Waste Collection Productivity;
- Recycling & Waste Management Service Restructure;
- Affordable Funeral Strategy;
- Biodiversity and Resilience of Ecosystems (BRED) Duty;
- Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarterly Performance;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Directorate Delivery Plan 2020/21;
- Planning, Transport & Environment – Improving Digitalisation;
- Cardiff Food Strategy;
- Transport for Wales – South Wales Metro Update;
- Transport White Paper.

Scrutiny Services, City and County of Cardiff,
Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk
© 2019 City and County of Cardiff